

additional papers 2

Executive Committee

Wed 9 Dec
2009
7.00 pm

Committee Room 2
Town Hall
Redditch



www.redditchbc.gov.uk

Access to Information - Your Rights

The Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985 widened the rights of press and public to attend Local Authority meetings and to see certain documents. Recently the Freedom of Information Act 2000, has further broadened these rights, and limited exemptions under the 1985 Act.

Your main rights are set out below:-

- Automatic right to attend all Council and Committee meetings unless the business would disclose confidential or “exempt” information.
- Automatic right to inspect agenda and public reports at least five days before the date of the meeting.
- Automatic right to inspect minutes of the Council and its Committees (or summaries of business undertaken in private) for up to six years following a meeting.
- Automatic right to inspect lists of background papers used in the preparation of public reports.
- Access, upon request, to the background papers on which reports are based for a period of up to four years from the date of the meeting.
- Access to a public register stating the names and addresses and electoral areas of all Councillors with details of the membership of all Committees etc.
- A reasonable number of copies of agenda and reports relating to items to be considered in public must be made available to the public attending meetings of the Council and its Committees etc.
- Access to a list specifying those powers which the Council has delegated to its Officers indicating also the titles of the Officers concerned.
- Access to a summary of the rights of the public to attend meetings of the Council and its Committees etc. and to inspect and copy documents.
- In addition, the public now has a right to be present when the Council determines “Key Decisions” unless the business would disclose confidential or “exempt” information.
- Unless otherwise stated, all items of business before the Executive Committee are Key Decisions.
- (Copies of Agenda Lists are published in advance of the meetings on the Council’s Website:
www.redditchbc.gov.uk

**If you have any queries on this Agenda or any of the decisions taken or wish to exercise any of the above rights of access to information, please contact
Ivor Westmore
Committee Support Services**

Town Hall, Walter Stranz Square, Redditch, B98 8AH
Tel: 01527 64252 (Extn. 3269) Fax: (01527) 65216
e.mail: committee@redditchbc.gov.uk Minicom: 595528

Welcome to today's meeting.

Guidance for the Public

Agenda Papers

The **Agenda List** at the front of the Agenda summarises the issues to be discussed and is followed by the Officers' full supporting **Reports**.

Chair

The Chair is responsible for the proper conduct of the meeting. Generally to one side of the Chair is the Committee Support Officer who gives advice on the proper conduct of the meeting and ensures that the debate and the decisions are properly recorded. On the Chair's other side are the relevant Council Officers. The Councillors ("Members") of the Committee occupy the remaining seats around the table.

Running Order

Items will normally be taken in the order printed but, in particular circumstances, the Chair may agree to vary the order.

Refreshments : tea, coffee and water are normally available at meetings - please serve yourself.

Decisions

Decisions at the meeting will be taken by the **Councillors** who are the democratically elected representatives. They are advised by **Officers** who are paid professionals and do not have a vote.

Members of the Public

Members of the public may, by prior arrangement, speak at meetings of the Council or its Committees. Specific procedures exist for Appeals Hearings or for meetings involving Licence or Planning Applications. For further information on this point, please speak to the Committee Support Officer.

Special Arrangements

If you have any particular needs, please contact the Committee Support Officer.

Infra-red devices for the hearing impaired are available on request at the meeting. Other facilities may require prior arrangement.

Further Information

If you require any further information, please contact the Committee Support Officer (see foot of page opposite).

Fire/ Emergency instructions

If the alarm is sounded, please leave the building by the nearest available exit – these are clearly indicated within all the Committee Rooms.

If you discover a fire, inform a member of staff or operate the nearest alarm call point (wall mounted red rectangular box). In the event of the fire alarm sounding, leave the building immediately following the fire exit signs. Officers have been appointed with responsibility to ensure that all visitors are escorted from the building.

Do Not stop to collect personal belongings.

Do Not use lifts.

Do Not re-enter the building until told to do so.

The emergency Assembly Area is on Walter Stranz Square.

Declaration of Interests: Guidance for Councillors

DO I HAVE A "PERSONAL INTEREST" ?

- Where the item relates or is likely to affect your **registered interests** (what you have declared on the formal Register of Interests)

OR

- Where a decision in relation to the item might reasonably be regarded as affecting **your own** well-being or financial position, or that of your **family**, or your **close associates** more than most other people affected by the issue,

you have a personal interest.

WHAT MUST I DO? **Declare the existence, and nature, of your interest and stay**

- The declaration must relate to specific business being decided - a general scattergun approach is not needed
- **Exception** - where interest arises only because of your membership of another **public body**, there is no need to declare unless you **speak** on the matter.
- You **can vote** on the matter.

IS IT A "PREJUDICIAL INTEREST" ?

In general only if:-

- It is a personal interest **and**
- The item affects your **financial position** (or conveys other benefits), or the position of your **family, close associates** or bodies through which you have a **registered interest** (or relates to the exercise of **regulatory functions** in relation to these groups)

and

- A member of public, with knowledge of the relevant facts, would reasonably believe the interest was likely to **prejudice** your judgement of the public interest.

WHAT MUST I DO? **Declare and Withdraw**

BUT you may make representations to the meeting before withdrawing, **if** the public have similar rights (such as the right to speak at Planning Committee).



Executive

Committee

9th December 2009

7.00 pm

Committee Room 2 Town Hall

**7. 'Opt-In' Chargeable
Garden Waste Collection
- Business Case -
Amended version**

(Pages 151 - 176)

Head of Environment

To consider the introduction of a paid for 'opt in' garden waste collection service during 2010/11.

PLEASE NOTE - This amended report replaces the version that was circulated as part of the main agenda pack

(Amended report attached)

(All Wards)

Executive Committee

No Direct Ward Relevance

9th December 2009

'OPT-IN' CHARGEABLE GARDEN WASTE COLLECTION – BUSINESS CASE

(Report of the Head of Environment and Head of Operations)

1. Summary of Proposals

The Joint Municipal Waste Management Strategy (JMWMS) 2009 sets the Partnership a target of 43% recycling/composting by 2014. As a signatory to the JMWMS 2009, Redditch Borough Council has committed to play its part and increase its recycling/composting rate (NI 192) to help achieve this. This report requests Members approval to introduce a paid for 'opt in' garden waste collection service during 2010/11.

2. Recommendations

The Committee is asked to **RECOMMEND** that:

- 1) the Council introduces a pilot chargeable 'opt-in' garden waste collection service in targeted areas of the Borough during the first half of 2010;**
- 2) depending on the outcomes and evaluation of the pilot, including financial implications, the effect on performance, publicity requirements, administration and environmental and operational impacts, the service be rolled out across the Borough during 2011/12;**
- 3) the pilot be carried out in the areas identified in the business case and that any additions or amendments to these areas be delegated to the Head of Environment in Consultation with the Leader and the Portfolio Holder for Housing, Local Environment and Health;**
- 4) the service standard for the collection of garden waste (Appendix B) be adopted, subject to any changes recommended by the Committee;**
- 5) the preferred option for the service, selected from the three detailed in the Business Case at Appendix A, be agreed;**

Executive Committee

9th December 2009

-
- 6) an initial one off set up charge to cover the cost of a bin be passed onto customers, including those in the pilot areas, OR bins be provided free of charge;
 - 7) that the Council's current collection policy relating to garden waste in grey bins is amended to coincide with the start of the new service to discourage garden waste being placed in grey bins;
 - 8) that the Council's current collection policy relating to the sale of orange sacks continues unaffected in the pilot areas but that residents purchasing orange sacks who live in the pilot areas will be provided with information about the new service, home composting and what happens to waste disposed of in orange sacks;
 - 9) that the orange sack policy is further considered as part of the evaluation of the pilot and the update report to Members;

RESOLVE that

- 10) an update report on the pilot service and recommendations for the roll out or cessation of the service be brought back to a future meeting of this Committee during 2010/11.

3. Financial, Legal, Policy, Risk and Sustainability Implications

Financial

- 3.1 The introduction of a pilot service will enable the Council to establish realistic customer take up and level of service charge. It is intended that the collection of garden waste would be self funding and costs to run the service would be recovered via the charge to customers taking up the service. However, full cost recovery may not be possible during the first year of the service and this is subject to Member decision on options included in Appendix A.
- 3.2 Customers could also be charged a one off cost to help to cover initial setting up costs and this is subject to Member decision.

Legal

- 3.3 The Council has a duty to collect household waste but may make a charge for the collection of garden waste.
- 3.4 Under the Waste and Emissions and Trading (WET) Act 2003 Local Authorities are required to meet stringent targets set by the Landfill

Executive

Committee

9th December 2009

Directive. Under the Landfill Allowance Trading Scheme (LATS) allowances have been allocated to waste disposal authorities (WCC) that set limits for the amount of biodegradable waste sent to landfill. There will be severe penalties (currently set at £150 per tonne) for exceeding the allocation.

Policy

- 3.5 The revised Joint Municipal Waste Management Strategy (JMWMS) which was brought to the Executive Committee for approval on 7th October 2009, supports the introduction of chargeable garden waste collections to improve performance on NI 192, % of household waste recycled/composted.

Risk

- 3.6 There is a risk that there would not be enough customer interest to make the service viable and the Business Case includes a number of options based on variable levels of customer take up. Consequently there is a risk that costs would not be recovered of providing the service to the pilot areas during 2010/11.
- 3.7 A pilot scheme will enable the council to assess the levels of customer take up and consequently costs incurred in running the service and is a way of mitigating the risk. Customers who come forward in the pilot areas will be informed that the service may be withdrawn after the first year.
- 3.8 There is a risk that if the Council does not commence a garden waste collection, performance in relation to NI 192 will drop significantly in comparison to both neighbouring authorities and the national trend, this would influence future Comprehensive Area Assessment outcomes and the Council's direction of travel.
- 3.9 The Council has to reduce carbon emissions from its operations (NI 185). The introduction of a garden waste collection service will increase carbon emissions and there is a risk that it will be more difficult for the council to reach its reduction targets.
- 3.10 There is a risk that if changes to waste collection policies are not made levels of take up could be affected.

Sustainability / Environmental

- 3.11 The revised Joint Municipal Waste Management Strategy is founded on the principles of sustainability and Climate Change is recognised as a key issue in the future delivery of waste services. The removal

of organic material from landfill, and the subsequent reduction in the production of methane, a potent Greenhouse Gas, is a key aim of both the national and our local waste strategies. More detailed considerations are included in the Business Case at appendix A.

- 3.12 As part of the overall sustainability of this new service, consideration has to be made of the positive economic effects of creating employment opportunities and support of a local business where the garden waste would be taken for processing.
- 3.13 Social benefits are that some residents wish to receive this service and it promotes positive environmental behaviour including a 'feel-good' factor in those taking part.

Report

4. Background

- 4.1 In 2006 the Council introduced an alternate weekly waste collection service and this has increased the level of recycling significantly to around 32% (outturn 2007/08). National Indicator 192 combines both recycling and composting and authorities leading performance on NI 192 offer collections of garden waste. NI 191 measures the amount of **residual** waste collected – i.e. waste not recycled, composted or re-used and has taken away the goal of reducing the total amount of waste collected.
- 4.2 At its meeting on 7th January 2009, the Executive Committee requested that, in order to meet increasing national targets for recycling and composting, the feasibility of a chargeable self funding 'opt-in' garden waste collection, and delivery of this in partnership with Bromsgrove District Council, be explored. Officers have now draw up a business case for Members' further consideration.

5. Key Issues

- 5.1 The original JMWMS adopted the principle of composting at home as the preferred way of dealing with garden waste and this approach remains. However it is now recognised that garden waste collections are a key way of significantly increasing performance in relation to NI 192 and that this is a service that some residents would like to receive (JMWMS consultation, February – May 2009).
- 5.2 The previous non statutory national target of recycling 33% of household waste by 2015 has now been significantly increased to 45%, rising to 50% by 2020. To achieve these levels of recycling, it will be necessary to introduce new collection/treatment systems.

Executive Committee

9th December 2009

Currently, despite a significant improvement in the level of waste recycled, the Council is in the bottom quartile for NI 192 - % of waste sent for re-use, recycling and composting. The following tables show previous and future targets that have been set for recycling / composting household waste and current predicted outturn performance in Worcestershire.

Year	Non statutory national target	Statutory performance standard	JMWMS Joint target
2007/8	25%	20%	24%
2008/09	25%	None set	24%
2009/10	40%	"	40%
2013/14	40%	"	43%
2015/16	45%	"	45%
2020	50%	"	50%

Authority	Predicted outturn	Paid for garden waste	Food waste collection
Wychavon	43%	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Bromsgrove	37%	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Worcester City	36%	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Redditch	30%		
Malvern Hills	28.5%	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Wyre Forest	27%		

- 5.3 Under the Landfill Allowance Trading Scheme (LATS), the County Council as the Waste Disposal Authority (WDA) has been set maximum allowances for the amount of biodegradable municipal (BMW) waste sent to landfill in future years. Based on current performance levels the County Council will not exceed allowances in 2010/11. If improvements, new treatment facilities or other alternatives are not delivered to divert BMW from landfill then the County Council could be subject to fines from 2010/11 onwards. A percentage of Redditch's grey bin waste is currently landfilled and the majority is sent to be treated at an energy from waste facility in Warwickshire. However there is a need to support the county wide approach, reduce the amount of waste which is disposed of and increase performance on NI 192.
- 5.4 In addition to LATS, the landfill tax escalator, the tax payable on each tonne of material landfilled, is now increasing by £8 per year from 2008 until at least 2010/11 to give greater incentive to divert waste away from landfill by amongst other things reducing, re-using and recycling waste; by 2010 the tax will be £48 per tonne.

- 5.5 The following provides the rationale why we should discourage garden waste being disposed of in grey bins
- a) We need to reduce the amount of garden waste (7% of total waste collected) which is disposed of in grey bins and contributes to landfill.
 - b) To ensure fairness, it would not be equitable for some people to pay for a garden waste collection and others to be able to continue to dispose of it free of charge in the grey bin.
 - c) Some residents would choose to use the service for environmental reasons, to ensure that their garden waste is composted. However, there has to be a further incentive to encourage other people to divert their waste from the grey bin.
 - d) An alternative for residents who do not wish to pay for the service or do not live in the pilot areas is still to home compost – further advice on home composting is available from <http://www.wastemissionimpossible.org.uk/composting/index.htm> This would be promoted to residents who placed garden waste in the grey bin and through general promotion.
- 5.6 The following provides the rationale for continuing the sale of orange sacks in the pilot areas :
- a) Overall the purchase of orange sacks is more expensive than the garden waste collection service and therefore residents will be encouraged to choose the cheaper option.
 - b) Keeps people on board and in particular residents who use the orange sacks to dispose of other household waste.
 - c) Allows us opportunity to review impacts on orange sack sales and implications for long term policy if orange sack sale was withdrawn across the Borough.
- 5.7 A business case for the introduction of a chargeable garden waste collection service is detailed in Appendix A. The business case outlines full details including resources needed, use of existing vehicles and staff, issues around procurement, potential partnership working and sharing of resources with BDC, the suggested pilot areas and number of properties to be targeted. Other considerations include publicity requirements and administrative systems needed to manage the customer base and payments made.

- 5.8 The Business Case indicates that
- a) The provision of an 'opt in' chargeable garden waste collection service supports the JMWMS commitment to achieve higher recycling/composting performance.
 - b) The council would need to review existing waste collection policies if a collection were to be introduced.
 - c) Some waste which is currently disposed of would be diverted to composting.
 - d) There would be an impact on climate change indicator NI 185.
 - e) That a pilot service during 2010/11 will allow us to mitigate risks associated with the introduction of the new service.
 - f) That the pilot areas should be in a compact areas of the town which is likely to attract the highest % of customer take up.
 - g) the number of customers taking up the service is critical in determining the right charge per customer to ensure cost recovery.
 - h) Option 1 is the most expensive as staffing costs are based on premium rates.
 - i) Option 2 is the mid range price and does not incur additional transport miles (vehicles moving from BDC to RBC) and is our recommended approach for running the pilot service.
 - j) Option 3 is the most cost effective but incurs additional transport miles.
- 5.9 In order to manage customer expectations and reduce risk, relatively small pilot areas should be targeted to assess levels of interest and allow us to gain a more detailed understanding of the financial implications, the effect on performance, publicity requirements, administration of the service and operational impacts. It will be necessary to develop publicity materials that will explain clearly to customers how the new service may be introduced and to make them aware that the service may be withdrawn in November 2010.
- 5.10 As with the alternate weekly collection service, it is essential to have an adopted service standard which provides details to customers about how the service works, for example the size of bin provided, what happens if the bin is not collected or goes missing and the

Executive Committee

9th December 2009

waste material that can be placed in the bin. A draft service standard has been produced and is included at Appendix B.

6. Other Implications

- Asset Management - None.
- Community Safety - Fly-tipping has been found to create a negative impact on people's feeling of safety which can contribute to a fear of crime. On a recent clean up event held in Oakenshaw a large amount of garden waste was found dumped in black sacks. The service may reduce fly-tipped garden waste, particularly for residents who have no method of transporting it to the Household Waste Site.
- Human Resources - The introduction of the new service will require resources and it is anticipated that this will be provided as overtime to existing employees in the first instance.
- Social Exclusion - Could benefit those residents who have no transport or means of travel to dispose of garden waste

7. Lessons Learnt

- 7.1 Whilst Redditch Borough Council has improved its recycling rate significantly in recent years, performance is still significantly lower than many authorities and we are currently in the bottom quartile for NI 192; this could be an issue in any future external judgements on the authority.
- 7.2 Redditch Borough Council needs to play its part in fulfilling the JMWMS.
- 7.3 Through the introduction of the alternate weekly collection service we have learned that an educative approach, giving residents information and advice, is the best way of introducing a new service. Therefore, in relation to both collecting garden waste in grey bins and the sale of orange sacks (recommendations 7 and 8) we would use the following approach:

-
- a) In the pilot areas residents will be provided with promotional material including information on the new service, home composting and what happens to waste placed in the orange sacks for collection – i.e. it is not composted and goes for disposal with residual waste.
 - b) A promotional approach period would be used where we would still empty grey bins that contained garden waste and at the same time provide residents with information and advice about home composting and the new service.
 - c) Residents within the pilot areas who purchase orange sacks will be provided with information at the point of purchase.
 - d) Monitoring of orange sack sales both in the pilot areas and Borough wide can be carried out during the pilot period.
 - e) Develop a long term policy on orange sacks as part of evaluation of pilot (recommendation 9)

8. **Background Papers**

The Joint Municipal Waste Management Strategy First Review, August 2009 (to be published January 2010).

9. **Consultation**

This report has been prepared in consultation with relevant Borough Council, County Council and Bromsgrove District Council Officers.

10. **Author of Report**

The authors of this report are Guy Revans, Head of Environment (Head of Environment) who can be contacted on extension 3292 (e-mail guy.revans@redditchbc.gov.uk), Terry Horne, Head of Operations who can be contacted on extension 3604 (terry.horne@redditchbc.gov.uk) and Sue Horrobin (waste Management Manager) who can be contacted on extension 3706 (e-mail: sue.horrobin@redditchbc.gov.uk) for more information.

11. **Appendices**

Appendix A - Business Case for the Collection of chargeable garden waste in Redditch

Appendix B - Draft Service Standard for the collection of Garden Waste

Appendix C - Garden Waste Collection Round.

12. Key to Abbreviations / Terms used in report

JMWMS – Joint Municipal Waste Management Strategy

LATS – Landfill Allowance Trading Scheme

BMW – biodegradable municipal waste

NI 191 - % of household waste not recycled, composted or re-used

NI 192 - % of household waste recycled, composted or re-used

Business Plan
Chargeable 'Opt-in' Garden Waste Collection
September 2009

1.0 Rationale for providing the Service – Joint Municipal Waste Management Strategy (JMWMS)

- 1.1 The Joint Municipal Waste Management Strategy (JMWMS) 2009 sets the Partnership a target of 43% recycling/composting by 2014. As a signatory to the JMWMS 2009, Redditch Borough Council has committed to play its part and increase its recycling/composting rate (NI 192) to help achieve this. This can be done through:
- Increasing the range of materials which are recycled through green bins
 - The introduction of a chargeable garden waste collection service
 - Recycling street sweepings
 - Increasing the amount of re-use within the Borough – e.g. through bulky collection service
- 1.2 There is a national target of 45% by 2015 that we would hope to meet, however in accordance with Principle 4 we will not compromise the environmental and economic performance of schemes just to meet notional, non statutory targets.
- 1.3 Currently, the majority of residual waste collected in Worcestershire is landfilled. The Partnership needs to reduce the amount of biodegradable waste to landfill in order to meet Landfill Allowance Trading Scheme limits in future years. Whilst the majority of residual waste collected in Redditch is disposed of through an energy from waste facility in Warwickshire, there is a need to consider Redditch's arrangements in a county wide context. Each tonne of waste diverted from this disposal route frees up capacity for waste from other Worcestershire authorities.
- 1.4 A chargeable garden waste collection falls outside the 'Core Service' and therefore costs should be recovered in line with JMWMS 2009 Policy 3.
- 1.5 In addition, 20% of residents surveyed said that they would be prepared to pay for a collection of garden waste (JMWMS consultation, May 2009) and given the current economic climate, there is potential for income generation. Other Worcestershire authorities have found that there is a demand for the service.

2.0 Current Waste Collection Policies

- 2.1 The council currently accepts small amounts of light garden waste in grey bins.
- 2.2 Orange sacks were introduced at the start of the AWC service so that residents had a way of disposing of occasional amounts of extra waste. Council policy is to collect a maximum of two orange sacks per household along with grey bin collections. In 2008/09 approximately 5,000 orange sacks were collected. A survey of collection crews has found that approximately 70% orange sacks contain garden waste during summer months and around 20% during winter months. Waste collected in this way is mixed into the residual waste stream and is not composted.

3.0 Home Composting

- 3.1 This remains as our preferred way of dealing with garden waste and in recent years a large number of compost bins have been sold. Residents will still be encouraged to deal with garden waste at home. However, the Partnership has now agreed that there needs to be an option of collecting garden waste for composting for the reasons outlined above.

4.0 Quantities of Garden Waste

- 4.1 Waste Composition Analysis has shown that 7% of the waste collected in the Borough through the household waste collection service is garden waste – this is approximately 1,330 tonnes per annum. The introduction of a chargeable garden waste collection would divert some of this waste from the disposal route.

5.0 Garden waste at the Household Waste Site

- 5.1 In 2008/09 **2,124** tonnes of garden waste were taken by residents to the Household waste site which involves residents using their own vehicles to transport small amounts of waste. WCC do not currently keep records of visits to the site, however if we estimate that each load weighs 50kg, then this equates to over 42,000 separate visits.

6.0 Predicted diversion and changes to waste collection policies

- 6.1 The introduction of a garden waste collection service will result in some of the garden waste which is currently disposed of in grey bins, orange sacks and at the HWS being reduced. The start of the new service would require the council to consider making changes to waste collection policies across the Borough or in areas where the garden waste collection service is offered as below:

- Policy on sale of orange sacks
- Policy on allowing small amounts of light garden waste to be disposed of in from grey bins

- 6.2 Subsequently this would mean a new statutory notice being issued and the development of a new service standard (appendix 2).

7.0 Coverage of the new service

- 7.1 Modelling has shown that the garden waste collection service should be to at least 20% of suitable households (approximately 32,000) in order to help meet the county wide targets outlined above.

8.0 Climate Change Impacts

- 8.1 The Strategic Environmental Assessment which forms part of the JMWMS, states that *“options which have area wide green waste collections secure more benefits overall than other options because of increased tonnages of waste recycled, principally biodegradable waste”* (SEA p.38).

- 8.2 There would be an impact on climate change indicator NI185 as mileage undertaken as part of the waste collection service would increase. Some estimates on the increase in mileage and carbon emissions is provided in the table below. Redditch Borough Council's current target for overall reduction is 2% year on year. To counter the increased emissions, reductions would be required elsewhere,

	Estimated mileage undertaken	Miles per gallon	Total no. gallons used	Resultant CO2 kg/ tonnes
Pilot area based on	1620	5	324	6858kg or 0.69 tonnes
Borough wide	8100	5	1620	34,288kg or 34.3 tonnes

NOTE: Figures are based on one RCV working for one day per week for 30 weeks

- 8.3 The total carbon produced last year from the council's vehicle fleet was 590,385kg or 590.39 tonnes. The Borough wide service could result in an estimated increase of 5.7% on the total carbon emissions from the council's fleet.
- 8.4 Round sizes on a garden waste collection would be larger as they would need to cover a wider area, however they would be based on existing geographical rounds to ensure that rounds were as efficient as possible in terms of transport distances.
- 8.5 It is difficult to assess the impact of the service on climate change indicator NI186. Relevant issues will include that whilst there is an increase in Redditch Borough Council's fleet, there is potentially a reduction in the number of visits to the Household Waste Site. Whilst Redditch Borough Council's waste currently goes to an energy from waste facility, diverting biodegradable waste from this route could provide capacity for other Worcestershire waste to be diverted from landfill.
- 8.6 The introduction of a garden waste collection service has been in other authorities to increase the overall the tonnage of waste collected. Waste that is currently disposed of in other ways – e.g. home composted or on bonfires etc is diverted to the collection instead. However, this is reduced when the collection is chargeable.
- 8.7 Providing a material which can be used as a soil conditioner locally may decrease the use of chemical fertilizer on agricultural ground which is a highly intensive/polluting manufacturing process. This is positive but unquantifiable.
- 8.8 There may be sideline benefits relating to public attitude in terms of changing their own behaviour at home and at work if they are given the opportunity to recycle more leading to additional sustainable behaviours. However, there is a potential risk that a garden waste collection will reduce the amount of home composting.

9.0 Type of Service

- 9.1 Having examined best practice amongst other authorities locally and nationally, the proposed service will be:

Service type	Rationale
240 litre Wheeled Bin NB in pilot area would be green 240 litre wheeled bin with stickered lid	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Health and Safety – easily manoeuvred by residents and crews. • Consistency with Partner authorities • Adequate capacity • In pilot area if the service was withdrawn these bins could be re-used
Alternate Weekly Collection	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Allows increased coverage • Proven to be cost effective, efficient and practical • Provides adequate capacity to most residents
'Curtilage' edge of property* collection and return	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Bins less likely to go missing • Council liability for missing bins reduced • Reduces number of days that bins are on streets (particularly if collection day is different to existing waste collection)
Seasonal 9 monthly service (March – November)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In other authorities it has been shown that the amount of garden waste dramatically reduces in winter months • Type of garden waste changes to larger items which are unsuitable for a wheeled bin collection

*where a property does not front onto a road, a designated collection point may be given instead.

10.0 Method of introducing the new service

10.1 Approximately 32,000 properties which potentially could be provided with a garden waste collection service. If 20% of residents took up the new service, as indicated through the consultation earlier this year, then this would mean around 6,200 households.

10.2 There are two options for introducing the service, both of which would allow full cost recovery but with a number of advantages and risks as outlined below:

Options for service introduction	Advantages	Risks
Full scale Borough Wide collection from March 2010	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Service provided to all residents • Increased recycling/composting rate • Potential increased income generation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Deliverability in short timescale • Limited staff resources and impacts on other priorities • Impacts of shared services including new senior management structure • Procurement of bins etc. • Difficult to withdraw service if proves to be uneconomic or

Options for service introduction	Advantages	Risks
		performs poorly

Options for service introduction	Advantages	Risks
Smaller scale pilot in targeted area from March 2010 followed by Borough wide roll out in 2011/12	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Allows us to assess take up, administration and publicity requirements, operational impacts, costs and service standard • Allows service to be modified before full roll out • Allows us to withdraw the service if necessary following evaluation • Procurement of bins will be easier due to smaller numbers • Publicity and administration (booking system) more manageable in targeted area • Allows development of a garden waste collection service across BDC and RBC 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Public dissatisfaction that they are not provided the service • May be a need to modify existing service standards – e.g. orange sacks – within the targeted area • Recycling/composting rate will be lower for 2010/11 • Income generation will be limited for 2010/11

10.3 Having looked at these options, it is recommended that a smaller scale pilot in targeted areas from March 2010 followed by Borough wide roll out in 2011/12 is adopted. This approach will reduce risks, is achievable and allows the development of a larger scale shared service in the longer term. It also ensures that progress is made and valuable lessons can be learned.

11.0 Pilot Areas

11.1 Appendix C contains a list of streets that would be included in the two pilot areas. One is an area of the town that contains a higher level of traditional housing with larger gardens, which will hopefully result in an improved level of take up. The other area is in the new town and contains properties with smaller gardens

11.2 It is important to match existing collection rounds to the proposed garden waste rounds as this will allow effective customer liaison and service administration.

12.0 Service Delivery Options

12.1 Three options have been identified to provide the service as detailed below:

- **Option one** - To provide the service during Saturdays using employed staff at premium rates and using owned vehicles,

- **Option two** - To provide the service during Monday to Friday using employed staff at standard pay rates and using hired vehicles
- **Option three** - To provide the service using Bromsgrove District Council staff at standard pay rates and BDC vehicles utilising week day capacity available due to four day working week.

12.2 It is important to note that efficiency reduces as the service is not provided to every property as with the AWC service.

12.3 All of the options are based on the providing the service on a standard 7.5 hour day and to a pilot area of 4676 properties.

10% Customer take up	Option one	Option two	Option three*
Day of service	Saturdays	Mon- Fri	week day capacity available due to four day working week
Staff – 1 driver, 1 loader	employed staff at premium rates	employed staff at standard pay rates	Bromsgrove District Council staff at standard pay rates
Vehicle**	owned vehicles	hired vehicles	BDC vehicles
Bins collected	200-220 per day	200-220 per day	200-220 per day
Cost of pilot area	£25,348	£22,268	£20,177
Whole town cost	£178,899	£157,165	£142,407
Cost per customer	£54.50	£48.00	£43.50

15% Customer take up	Option one	Option two	Option three*
Day of service	Saturdays	Mon- Fri	week day capacity available due to four day working week
Staff – 1 driver, 1 loader	employed staff at premium rates	employed staff at standard pay rates	Bromsgrove District Council staff at standard pay rates
Vehicle**	owned vehicles	hired vehicles	BDC vehicles
Bins collected	250 -270 per day	250 -270 per day	250 -270 per day
Cost of pilot area	£29,343	£25,778	£21,503
Whole town cost	£207,098	£181,938	£151,761
Cost per customer	£42.00	£37.00	£31.00

20% Customer take up	Option one	Option two	Option three*
Day of service	Saturdays	Mon- Fri	week day capacity available due to four day working week
Length of day	7.5	7.5	7.5
Staff – 1 driver, 1 loader	employed staff at premium rates	employed staff at standard pay rates	Bromsgrove District Council staff at standard pay rates

Vehicle**	owned vehicles	hired vehicles	BDC vehicles
Round Size	280-300 per day	280-300 per day	280-300 per day
Cost of pilot area	£34,228	£30,070	£26,686
Whole town cost	£241,572	£212,224	£188,342
Cost per customer	£37.00	£32.50	£29.00

*Notes – Option 3

- Subject to confirmation that BDC is able to operate the service using standard staffing pay rates.
- Factors in the cost of 40 minutes additional travel time between Bromsgrove and Redditch for each day for each vehicle used otherwise it would reduce the number of bins collected in a 7.5 hour day by 18.
- Increase in the fuel consumption for each round per day of 17.5 litres
- Would require bin lifters currently fitted to Bromsgrove District Council vehicles to be compatible with the type of wheeled bins provided for Redditch residents which are of a different design to those currently provided for Bromsgrove residents. Lifters are available which can easily reconfigured to accommodate different types of bins otherwise it would take approximately 2 fitter hours to exchange a bin lifter per two occasions at a cost of £30.00 excluding 'on costs'.

12.4 Option two is our recommended approach for running the pilot service as it provides the most flexibility and least risk and allows us time to work up some longer term options for delivering the service in partnership with Bromsgrove.

13.0 Customer take up and pricing

13.1 It is difficult to accurately predict the level of customer take up that can be expected, which is why we need to consider a number of take up options. With a higher level of customer take up, the cost per customer can be reduced. If we predict a level of customer take up which is not achieved, there is a risk that cost recovery will not be possible. We have to strike a balance between a charge which will be acceptable and encourage people to take up the service, against reducing the risk of non recovery of costs.

14.0 Additional Pricing band options

14.1 The costs shown in the tables above show the charge per customer in order to recover costs fully. However, we have been asked to provide a model showing the impact of providing the service for a number of charges per customer, and these have been detailed in the tables below. It can be seen that full cost recovery does not occur until we have achieved 15% customer take up, using Option 3.

10% Customer take up	Option one	Option two	Option three*
@ £25.00 customer charge	Pilot area = under recovery of £13,673 Whole town = under recovery of £97,664	Pilot area = under recovery of £10,595 Whole town = under recovery of £75,678	Pilot area = under recovery of £8,502 Whole town = under recovery of £60,728
@ £30.00 customer charge	Pilot area = under recovery of £11,338 Whole town = under	Pilot area = under recovery of £8,258 Whole town = under	Pilot area = under recovery of £6,167 Whole town = under

Appendix A

	recovery of £80,985	recovery of £58,985	recovery of £44,050
@ £35.00 customer charge	Pilot area = under recovery of £9,003 Whole town = under recovery of £64,307	Pilot area = under recovery of £5,923 Whole town = under recovery of £42,307	Pilot area = under recovery of £3,832 Whole town = under recovery of £27,371

15% Customer take up	Option one	Option two	Option three*
@ £25.00 customer charge	Pilot area = under recovery of £11,818 Whole town = under recovery of £84,414	Pilot area = under recovery of £8,253 Whole town = under recovery of £58,950	Pilot area = under recovery of £3,978 Whole town = under recovery of £28,414
@ £30.00 customer charge	Pilot area = under recovery of £8,313 Whole town = under recovery of £59,378	Pilot area = under recovery of £4,748 Whole town = under recovery of £33,914	Pilot area = under recovery of £473 Whole town = under recovery of £3,378
@ £35.00 customer charge	Pilot area = under recovery of £4,808 Whole town = under recovery of £34,342	Pilot area = under recovery of £1,234 Whole town = under recovery of £8,878	Pilot area = surplus of £3,832 Whole town = surplus of £27,371

20% Customer take up	Option one	Option two	Option three*
@ £25.00 customer charge	Pilot area = under recovery of £10,853 Whole town = under recovery of £77,521	Pilot area = under recovery of £6,695 Whole town = under recovery of £47,821	Pilot area = under recovery of £3,311 Whole town = under recovery of £23,650
@ £30.00 customer charge	Pilot area = under recovery of £6,178 Whole town = under recovery of £44,128	Pilot area = under recovery of £2,020 Whole town = under recovery of £14,428	Pilot area = surplus of £1,364 Whole town = surplus of £9,742
@ £35.00 customer charge	Pilot area = under recovery of £1,503 Whole town = under recovery of £10,735	Pilot area = surplus £2,655 Whole town = surplus of £18,964	Pilot area = surplus of £6,039 Whole town = surplus of £43,135

15.0 Set up costs

- 15.1 Set up costs include the cost of purchasing 240lt green stickered wheeled bins. Each wheeled bin currently costs £20.00. For example, the cost of purchasing bins so that up to 10% of residents in the pilot areas can take part is £9,400.
- 15.2 There is the option of charging a one off fee to cover the initial cost of the bin. This approach has been taken in Worcester City and helps with the recovery of costs. If this approach is taken in the pilot areas, using green bins with stickered lids, if the service was not rolled out at the end of the pilot year the bins could be bought back from residents and re-used by the Council.
- 15.3 There will be some publicity required and it is estimated that we would need a budget of £5,000 to provide publicity materials to the pilot areas. This would be prioritised from within existing budgets.

- 15.4 Administration systems will need to be set up and it is anticipated that this could be done within existing resources using existing software systems.
- 15.5 There are currently funds available within the waste management service which may be able to be reallocated to fund set up costs of the service.
- 15.6 The Council would need to decide if the set up costs should be passed onto the customer as a one off fee as has been done in Worcester City.

16.0 Monitoring and evaluation of pilot

- 16.1 The following will be considered in the evaluation of the service in the two pilot areas.
- effect on performance
 - environmental impacts
 - levels of customer take up
 - effectiveness of publicity
 - income generated
 - customer satisfaction and qualitative information gained through a survey
 - administrative and operational impacts

17.0 Conclusions

- The provision of an 'opt in' chargeable garden waste collection service supports the JMWMS commitment to achieve higher recycling/composting performance and the Strategic Environmental Assessment indicates that this is a good option.
- Existing waste collection policies would need to be reviewed if a collection were to be introduced.
- Some waste which is currently disposed of would be diverted to composting
- There would be an impact on climate change indicator NI 185.
- The introduction of a pilot service during 2010/11 will allow us to mitigate risks associated with the introduction of the new service.
- The pilot areas should be in compact areas of the town which are likely to attract the highest % of customer take up.
- The number of customers taking up the service is critical in determining the right charge per customer to ensure cost recovery.
- Option 1 is the most expensive as staffing costs are based on premium rates.
- Option 2 is the mid range price and does not incur additional transport miles (vehicles moving from BDC to RBC).
- Option 3 is the most cost effective but incurs additional transport miles.

Appendix B

Service Standard No. 8 – Collection of Garden Waste

Wherever possible residents are encouraged to home compost garden waste as this is the most environmentally friendly way of dealing with it. Composting garden waste and vegetable peelings is an excellent and easy way of turning waste into a useful resource for your garden.

For more information on home composting visit www.wastemissionimpossible.org.uk

Our garden waste collection service is specifically designed for residents who generate a lot of garden waste but don't have sufficient home composting facilities.

What the Council will do:

- Provide an alternate weekly chargeable garden waste collection service at a price to be confirmed and advertise the service to ensure that residents are aware of it.
- In the case that the service is oversubscribed, place residents on a waiting list and keep them informed regarding if and when they are able to take up the service.
- Provide residents who subscribe to the service with a brown 240 litre wheeled bin or additional bins if requested. NB the standard collection charge per bin will be levied for each additional bin.
- Collect and empty bins or containers from an accessible point on the customer's property on the designated collection week and day between the hours of 7:30am and 6:00pm.
- Return the bin or containers to the same point on the customer's property and ensure that it is left in a safe position.
- Tag the bin or put a card through the door to explain the reason if we are unable to empty a bin because it contains the wrong items.
- Return to empty missed bins within 2 working days if we have not informed the resident of the reason why it was not emptied and made a record of this
- Set up a method to allow payment to be made via direct debit etc annually
- The Council will not provide residents with a second or larger grey bin for the disposal of garden waste.
- Provide customers with three months notice of any permanent change to or withdrawal of the service.

What our customers need to do:

- Choose if you wish to receive the service and contact us to make arrangements, including the necessary annual payment.

- Present the brown bin for collection at the nearest point on your property nearest the road on the designated day and week by 7:30am.
- Ensure that all the garden waste presented for collection is contained within the bin provided and that the lid is fully closed.
- Let us know if you have any special requirements or experience problems regarding the service.
- Give the council one months notice if you wish to cancel the service (NB refunds will not be given).
- Only place in the bin the correct materials as listed below:

Yes please

Grass cuttings
Hedge and shrub
clippings
Leaves, twigs and bark
Small plants and weeds
Cut flowers
Windfall fruit

No thanks

Kitchen waste (waste food, veg peelings, tea bags and
eggshells)
Dog / cat waste
Plastic bags, pots or trays
Soil, stones, bricks or rubble
Branches or tree stumps over 4 inches (7.5cm) in diameter

- In areas where no garden waste collection service is in place, you are able to place small amounts of light garden waste in the grey wheeled bin or in orange sacks. However, it should be noted that this waste is not composted and is either incinerated or goes to landfill.

Household Waste Site – Crossgate Road, Park Farm

- You can take your garden waste to the dedicated garden waste skips here and it will be composted and turned into soil improver, which you can then buy back from the site to help improve your garden soil.

Appendix C

Round 1 - Running Order - Grey			
Day	Road/Close	Area	No. of Prop
Wednesday	Damson Close	Walkwood	29
Wednesday	Prudden Close	Walkwood	6
Wednesday	Newport Close	Walkwood	32
Wednesday	Moorcroft Close	Walkwood	35
Wednesday	Moorcroft Gardens	Walkwood	88
Wednesday	Longborough Close	Walkwood	5
Wednesday	Milford Close	Walkwood	61
Wednesday	Oswestry Close	Walkwood	43
Wednesday	Morton Lane	Walkwood	5
Wednesday	Callow Hill Lane	Callow Hill	10
Wednesday	Stanford Close	Callow Hill	10
Wednesday	Parmington Close	Callow Hill	23
Wednesday	Summerhouse Close / Windmill Gardens	Callow Hill	25
Wednesday	Foxholes Lane	Callow Hill	73
Wednesday	Wychbold Close	Callow Hill	10
Wednesday	Woodbury Close	Callow Hill	33
Wednesday	Valley Close	Callow Hill	13
Wednesday	Upleadon Close	Callow Hill	12
Wednesday	Tanwood Close	Callow Hill	27
Wednesday	Underwood Close	Callow Hill	89
Wednesday	Partridge Lane	Callow Hill	34
Wednesday	Woodgreen Close	Callow Hill	8
Wednesday	Thornccliffe Close	Callow Hill	6
Wednesday	Coleshill Close	Hunt End	46
Wednesday	Didcot Close	Hunt End	24
Wednesday	Hunt End Lane	Hunt End	33
Wednesday	Elmstone Close	Hunt End	16
Wednesday	Enfield Road	Hunt End	39
Wednesday	Weavers Hill	Hunt End	10
Wednesday	Weavers Close	Hunt End	5
Wednesday	Wadbury Hill	Hunt End	6
Wednesday	Dagtail Lane	Hunt End	31
Wednesday	Brookhampton Close	Hunt End	4
Wednesday	Alderminster Close	Hunt End	3
Wednesday	Stonepits Lane	Hunt End	38
Wednesday	Farmcote Close	Hunt End	10
Wednesday	Elmhurst Close	Hunt End	18
Wednesday	Ditchford Close	Hunt End	19
Wednesday	Claverdon Close	Hunt End	31
Wednesday	Chesterton Close	Hunt End	54
Wednesday	Brookfield Close	Hunt End	48
Wednesday	Ashmores Close	Hunt End	40
			1152

Round 2 - Running Order - Grey			
Day	Road / Close	Area	No. of Prop
Wednesday	Crumpfields Lane	Webheath	89
Wednesday	Lower Grinsty Lane	Webheath	16
Wednesday	Hill Top	Webheath	6
Wednesday	Church Road	Webheath	46
Wednesday	Pumphouse Lane	Webheath	10
Wednesday	Earls Close	Webheath	18
Wednesday	Grazing Lane	Webheath	17
Wednesday	Shirehampton Close	Webheath	60
Wednesday	Great Hockings Lane	Webheath	40
Wednesday	Defford Close	Webheath	47
Wednesday	Corner Lane	Webheath	25
Wednesday	Blockley Close	Webheath	17
Wednesday	Acre Lane	Webheath	7
Wednesday	Birchfield Road	Webheath	3
Wednesday	Foxlydiate Lane / Springhill Dr/Springhill Gardens	Webheath	10
Wednesday	Heathfield Road	Webheath	150
Wednesday	Tynsall Avenue	Webheath	21
Wednesday	Downsell Road	Webheath	51
Wednesday	Boxnott Close	Webheath	12
Wednesday	Reyde Close	Webheath	30
Wednesday	Lyndenwood	Webheath	13
Wednesday	Springvale Road	Webheath	49
Wednesday	Sheltwood Close	Webheath	10
Wednesday	Raglis Close	Webheath	11
Wednesday	Packwood Close	Webheath	80
Wednesday	Neighbrook Close	Webheath	34
Wednesday	Michaelwood Close	Webheath	49
Wednesday	Lordswood Close	Webheath	44
Wednesday	Knightsford Close	Webheath	8
Wednesday	Sydnall Close	Webheath	21
Wednesday	Sheepcroft Close	Webheath	57
Wednesday	Shaws Close	Webheath	15
Wednesday	Hennals Avenue	Webheath	22
Wednesday	Brotherton Avenue	Webheath	30
Wednesday	Sandygate Close	Webheath	40
			1158

Round 1 - Running Order - Grey			
Day	Road/Close	Area	No. of Prop
Monday	Winyates way- St Georges Court	Winyates	4
Monday	Holyoakes Close	Winyates East	28
Monday	Birmingham Road MG	Mappleborough Green	3
Monday	Norton Close	Matchborough East	12
Monday	Allensmore Close	Matchborough East	32
Monday	Munsley Close	Matchborough East	48
Monday	Bishopstone Close	Matchborough East	21
Monday	Cradley Close	Matchborough East	23
Monday	Ledbury Close	Matchborough East	66
Monday	Kenchester Close	Matchborough East	50
Monday	Hatfield Close	Matchborough East	27
Monday	Garway Close	Matchborough East	73
Monday	Goosehill Close	Matchborough East	25
Monday	Felton Close	Matchborough East	104
Monday	Jackfield Close	Matchborough East	38
Monday	Easenhall Lane	Matchborough East	29
Monday	Haseley Close	Matchborough East	65
Monday	Ganborough Close	Matchborough East	11
Monday	Farnborough Close	Matchborough East	42
Monday	Dunchurch Close	Matchborough East	35
Monday	Cosford Close	Matchborough East	22
Monday	Binton Close	Matchborough East	50
Monday	Atherstone Close	Matchborough East	38
Monday	Ansley Close	Matchborough East	35
Monday	Avenbury Close	Matchborough East	21
Monday	Bartestree Close	Matchborough East	24
Monday	Barford Close	Matchborough East	26
Monday	Cherington Close	Matchborough East	50
Monday	Dilwyn Close	Matchborough East	28
Monday	Winward Road	Matchborough East	1
Monday	Croome Close	Matchborough East	40
Monday	Eardisley Close	Matchborough East	32
Monday	Winforton Close	Winyates West	56
Monday	Stapleton Close	Winyates West	43
Monday	Dolden Lane	Winyates West	45
			1247

Round 6 - Running Order - Grey			
Day	Road/Close	Area	No. of prop
Monday	Alveley Close	Winyates West	7
Monday	Badger Close	Winyates West	54
Monday	Caynham Close	Winyates West	70
Monday	Dinedor Close	Winyates West	9
Monday	Edgmond Close	Winyates West	80
Monday	Farlow Close	Winyates West	9
Monday	Hentland Close	Winyates West	6
Monday	Insetton Close	Winyates West	29
Monday	Jakemans Close	Winyates West	13
Monday	Lassington Close	Winyates West	29
Monday	Kitebrook Close	Winyates West	18
Monday	Hopyard Lane	Winyates West	25
Monday	Middleton Close	Winyates East	52
Monday	Middleton Mews	Winyates East	54
Monday	Blakemere Close	Winyates East	56
Monday	Linton Close and Linton Mews	Winyates East	104
Monday	Barrow Close	Winyates East	37
Monday	Kilpeck Close	Winyates East	19
Monday	Cardington Close	Winyates East	10
Monday	Huntington Close	Winyates East	27
Monday	Goodrich Close	Winyates East	69
Monday	Tillington Close	Winyates East	71
Monday	Winslow Close	Winyates West	12
Monday	Upton Close	Winyates East	20
Monday	Leysters Close	Winyates East	12
Monday	Treville Close	Winyates East	85
Monday	Shawbury Close	Winyates East	59
Monday	Romsley Close	Winyates East	23
Monday	Quibury Close	Winyates East	23
Monday	Petton Close	Winyates East	47
Monday	Atcham Close	Winyates East	112
			1241